



Volume 10, Issue 1, January2023, p. 126-133

Article Information

Article Type: Research Article

Doi Number: http://dx.doi.org/10.17121/ressjournal.3324

ArticleHistory:
Received
10/12/2022
Accept
14/01/2023
Available
online
15/01/2023

THE THEORETICAL SPIRITUAL LIFE AND RELIGION

KURAMSAL AÇIDAN MANEVİ HAYAT VE DİN¹

Gürkan ÇİL2

Abstract

Although it is said that there is a spiritual structure of religious conceptions in the studies carried out, it is worth noting that spirituality is a door that opens from within this spiritual structure. It can be said that religion, which is seen as a superstructure institution, is involved in relationships in all areas of life. It is seen that religion and spirituality were confused in the early periods, but as we come to the present, this idea has been abandoned. However, it is also worth noting that spirituality does not have a purely spiritual meaning, but is a concept that has a corresponding meaning in practice. It can be stated within the scope of the study that spirituality is relational by nature, that it has a connection between religion and moral values, that it has an impact on shaping lived experiences, and that it is necessary to employ the concepts of prejudice and Decency in understanding. In addition, the study is based on the problematic of creating a model of how religious and spiritual elements contained in the field of faith can be evaluated relationally.

Keywords: Religion, Spritual, Sprituality, Relational Sociology.

Özet

Yapılan çalışmalarda din anlayışlarının tözcü yapısının bulunduğunu söylemekle beraber maneviyatın bu tözcü yapı içerisinden açılan bir kapı olduğunu belirtmekte fayda vardır. Bir üst yapı kurumu olarak görülen dinin hayatın her alanında ilişkilere müdahil olduğu söylenebilir. Din ve maneviyatın ilk dönemlerde karıştırıldığını ancak günümüze gelindikçe bu düşüncenin terk edildiği görülmektedir. Bunula beraber maneviyatın salt ruhsal anlamının olmadığını pratikte de karşılığı bulunan bir kavram olduğu da dikkat çekmektedir. Maneviyatın doğası gereği ilişkisel olduğunu, din ve ahlaki değerler arasında bir bağı olduğunu, yaşanmış deneyimlerin şekillenmesinde etkisi olduğunu, anlaşılması hususunda ön yargı ve hoşgörü kavramlarını işe koşmak gerektiği çalışma kapsamında ifade edilebilir. Ayrıca çalışma, inanç alanı içerisinde yer alan dini ve manevi unsurların ilişkisel olarak nasıl değerlendirilebileceğine dair bir model oluşturma sorunsalına dayanmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Din, Maneviyat, Manevi Hayat, İlişkisel Sosyoloji.

¹ Bu çalışma Doç. Dr. Abdullah ALPEREN danışmanlığındaki Manevi Hayat ve Din: Çanakkale Örneği adlı doktora tezinden üretilmiştir.

²- Öğr. Gör. Dr., Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart Üniversitesi, Bayramiç Meslek Yüksekokulu, Pazarlama ve Reklamcılık Bölümü, Halkla İlişkiler ve Tantım Programı, gurkancil@comu.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0002-3721-9810

Introduction

To express the traditional type of society briefly, it has a simple structure in socio-economic and socio-cultural terms. It can be stated that it has an adequate economy and a limited technology in itself. We see that there is a global situation; There is a limited production, the demographic structure and social mobility in society are limited, the social organization is based on the age groups and kinship system, religious activities and socio-cultural activities are mixed together. This circumstance testifies that the social organization of society has a strict affiliation with the sacred, and therefore it is characterized as such. In addition, the traditional social culture – which derives its basic values from the sanctity of religion - forms a whole and the individual integrates with society in the process of socialization (Günay, 1986: 357).

We can express modern society as an industrial society in which relations are more complex and have less transitivity than traditional society structure, technology is developed, machines have Decamped between human and nature (Zembilci, 2017: 2). As a result of the secularization that took place along with this process, religion became individualized, freed from social influences and withdrew into its essential field, turning into an identity of conscience and individual choice. Nowadays, modern city life has led individuals to religion. People who were pushed into loneliness by the secularization event have started to turn to community life and seek refuge (Sarıbay, 1994: 20).

Conceptualization of Religion and Religiosity

Religion is a very important social institution that shaped social life in the earliest periods of history as well. It is an element that shapes family life, economy, politics, education and the rest of social life. We can say that his influence had little influence in some societies and completely in some societies. The influence of religion in other institutions; for example, in the field of politics, again varies according to the forms of government, but with the aim of legitimizing the practices of those in power. In other words, it's like when the government or anyone in the administration uses religion in what they do. Pre-modern societies, especially in medieval Europe, who are spread in all areas of social life at the same time the King's power has been given by God religious kutsaliyet in a case like that of religion is broad and diverse domain of eminent domain is an indication that other social institutions (Apali, 2020: 185).

If we make a general definition based on this, religion can be seen as a set of practices and symbols that are considered sacred based on the understanding of faith, worship and affiliation. Thus, religion is the manifestation of the communication that takes place between the believer and the holy one in the believer's life (Wach, 1990: 43-61).

Religion is a social institution that has emerged and developed in the way of meeting certain needs in the social structure. Sociologists of religion put forward three approaches to explaining these relationships and functions. The first is the structural-functionalist approach, the second is the confrontational approach, and finally, the approach that states that religion has effects on society and society has effects on religion (Cil, 2020: 56).

The functionalist approach; each subsystem ensures the order and harmony of the system as a whole. According to structural functionalist approaches, one of the most obvious functions of the institution of religion is that it adds meaning to life and creates a spiritual foundation for people (Newman, 2013: 72).

The confrontational approach is the theories that evaluate the institution of religion within the class-economic reality (Topses, 2006: 135). It is argued that religion is a system of beliefs and values that are shaped according to the characteristics of the social structure.

Finally, the approach that it has mutual interaction; in this approach, the mutual effects and reactions of religion and society are tried to be understood and explained comparatively. Weber sees religion as a "meaningful problem". According to Parsons, this concept refers not only to a person's emotional adjustment, but also to the need for faith when faced with problems such as death and pain. Religious concepts also have an

impact on decision-making and choice in the realization of a certain goal of human action (Çil, 2020: 57; Karaşahin, 2006). Arguing that religion has an exceptional place in social institutions, Weber points out that it has mutual relations with other social institutions (Apali, 2020: 181).

Spirituality and Spiritual Life

Spirituality has been defined in various ways in the literature. Spirituality is defined as the strategies developed by an individual against his/her life experiences (Shaw, 2005: 350). When the concept of spirituality is considered in its historical use, it is seen that this concept is mostly used as "certain positive inner characteristics and perceptions" (Kurtz, 2000: 20). Cloninger defines spirituality as a developmental process that results in appearances such as loss of self, recognition of one's beyond-self identity, spiritual (spiritual) acceptance, and developmental maturity (Kirk et al., 1999: 82) In Cloninger's temperament and personality inventory, "spirituality" is located under the "selftranscendence" section, which is considered a sub-dimension of temperament. Hamer also talks about the similarity of the concepts of spirituality and self-transcendence, emphasizing that the easiest way to measure spirituality (spirituality) is to measure "selftranscendence". According to Hamer, spirituality is used to describe spiritual feelings that are independent of traditional religion. Therefore, a fixed belief in God is not directly related to religious practices (Hamer, 2005: 18; Türkyılmaz, 2008: 43). "The relationship established with a supreme power that affects the way a person operates in the world" (Armstrong, 1995: 3), "individual search for existential meaning" (Doyle, 1992: 302) are some of them.

The increase in studies on spirituality in the literature and the installation of new meanings of the concept of spirituality have brought a movement to the field (Düzgüner, 2013a: 7).

The concept of spirituality, which has been intensely interested in recent years, has a very ancient historical past. It has been used in different ways in a wide historical process. In addition to the phenomena of religion and religiosity, it has been associated with the phenomena of the soul and transcendental being, but it has also been an important subject of study sociologically as well as in the field of psychology. The relationship of soul-body and human-transcendental being has been influential in the emergence of modern psychology (Düzgüner, 2013b: 254).

In the first periods before Christ, the meaning given to the soul was strong, invisible to the eye, whose body acted, while psychology, which progressed towards becoming a science, was given meanings such as mental, mental periods, consciousness, subconscious to the soul in later periods, and the period that began spiritually shifted towards the material one. 21. Where it came from with its face, there was a change in the understanding and use of ISE again, and the focus of attention, which is matter, was again changed to the right direction, which is spiritual and transcendental (Düzgüner, 2013a: 281; McClendon, 2012: 209).

Spirituality, in the definitions made by researchers in the sociology literature, which are related to human potential, ultimate goals, love, the Creator, etc. a broad concept that has a connection with topics (Tart, 1975: 4); the transcendental dimension embedded in human experience (Shafranske and Gorsuch, 1984: 231); man's response to the Creator's compassionate call to man related to establishing a relationship with himself (Benner, 1989: 20); transcendence is a form of being and experience that is seen through realization and is related to a person's life, arises in an individual in relation to himself and what he sees as ultimate (Elkins et al., 1988) sacred relevant individual experience (Vaughan 1991: 105); the individual containing within himself to communicate with the sacred being (Fahlberg and Fahlberg, 1991: 274); to release an individual's search for meaning in life, things that have the soul to call (Weaver and Cotrell, 1992); the quest of the meaning of individual existence (Doyle, 1992: 302); the belief of the individual in their daily lives to spend the ultimate conditions of existence of people with a way of setting up the relationship (Hart, 1994: 23); so that the person can perform the action at a point in the world to be affected by the exalted relationship with a higher power (Armstrong,

1995: 3); an internal energy source that gives power to the people (Chee, 2002: 11), thank nourish the spiritual aspect of humans, perseverance, patience, prayer, Justice, self-sacrifice, such as values (Özdoğan, 2006a) of the essence of a person overflowing from its creator founded by bond (Özdoğan, 2009) is defined as.

Spirituality, meaning and purpose for humanity as a necessary phenomenon installed on a quest for individual, individual self-starting, with the beings around, interaction and communication with the Saints, sociological, cultural, religious, philosophical and secular beliefs, covering the structure (Puchalski et al., 2014). The communication of the individual starting from himself towards his environment and the Creator constitutes the basic dynamics of spirituality. The spiritual well-being of an individual is connected with the correctness of this three-way communication (Dyson et al., 1997). Spirituality is a lifestyle related to an individual's awareness of his existence, directing his life, making life more meaningful for him, experiencing the beliefs and feelings that are at the core of it. Spirituality has a feature that allows an individual to live in peace within a framework that begins with his environment and extends to the Creator (Fisher, 2011: 20).

Spirituality is considered by the majority of sociologists and psychologists as a special belonging to the inner being created by man. The maneuver, which is evaluated from this point of view, includes periods such as "meaning, communication with the unknowns of the world and the discovery of an individual's understanding in his life" (Huitt and Robbins, 2003). In a similar statement, the maneuver covers the field of "integrative energy (power and force)", "values and beliefs", "process and journey", "personality itself, others, higher Decency, space, connection with the environment", "the meaning and purpose of life as existence, search for answers to questions" (Dyson et al., 1997; Lepherd, 2015).

Based on the literature review, the Mountaineer (2020) said that some basic themes can be mentioned in the definition of spirituality. According to this:

- 1. All people have a potential for spiritual progress in their inner world.
- 2. Spirituality is a relational structure by its nature.
- 3. There is a connection between spirituality and religion and moral Decencies.
- 4. Lived experiences are important in shaping spirituality.
- 5. Spirituality has hidden aspects.

In the definitions related to spirituality and religion, it has been stated either that spirituality encompasses religion and that they have a structure that complements each other, or a clear understanding has not been put forward in the studies to explain these concepts. In some cases the distinction between religion and spirituality, religion a person's inner being official, has been described as organized by outward; not necessarily in the way spirituality is described in a formal way as it covers a wider area, the official resulted in (Lepherd, 2015; Pesut et al., 2008; Puchalski et al., 2009).

After the relationship of spirituality with religion, another issue that needs to be explained is the relationship of spirituality with religiosity. It is seen that there are basically three perspectives on the relationship between spirituality and religiosity in the minds of the researchers. Dec. The first of these is the perspective that sees spirituality as a holistic part of religiosity. The second is the perspective that considers spirituality and religiosity synonymous. The third and final point of view is the point of view that distinguishes religiosity and spirituality from each other. The existence of these perspectives shows the complexity at the point of defining spirituality and the need for further expansion of efforts to define spirituality and investigations (Gross, 2006; Schlehofer, 2008; Streib and Hood, 2010).. Spirituality has hidden aspects.

Religion-Spirituality: Religiosity and Spiritual Life

It is obvious that there is a confusion of concepts about spirituality. For this reason, Spilka (1993) described the concept of spirituality as "a fuzzy concept that is passionately wrapped in uncertainty" (Düzgüner, 2013: 23). So, what is this fuzzy (fuzzy) or

uncertainty? "Fuzzy logic (fuzzy logic) rizomatik and contextual interaction, whether or not a specific identity is conflicting with other identities, and virtually biraradalik yanyanalik based on the pattern of collective identities of the community as a contextual basis on historical, cultural, social, economic, and political mechanisms by which the identity component of "have-to be able to," and includes the possibility of creating the surface of a hegemonic discourse. It includes both "either, or" and "and", "not 1 or 0, which becomes evident by the fact that what exists virtually, contextually, becomes the level of discourse. Fuzzy logic (fuzzy logic) is used to assign logical values to uncertain events that we encounter in our daily lives, that is, it serves to evaluate the probabilities between Decisively true or false in our thoughts. The rhizomatic model, on the other hand, expresses the change in the hierarchy of possibilities according to the "context"." (Uluocak, 2005: 19).

Another factor that causes a change in the perception of religion is globalization. Based on the idea that globalization has turned the world into a small village, the fact that the speed of information flow has reached incredible levels, the effects of this speed and the increase in transportation opportunities are also observed in the fields of religion and spirituality. Although it is stated that the "things" that determine approaches to religion differ in the global world, it would be appropriate to say that it is effective for individuals from the ability to choose between religions to Decrying universal concepts such as equality, justice, freedom. It is not surprising that Eastern religions and traditions, especially a number of spiritual communities and practices –considering that they are in search of individuals- have become widespread in the West as well (Düzgüner, 2013: 17-18).

In addition to the fact that all these aspects are effective in the emergence of spirituality in the modern sense, it would be fair to say that the main triggering dynamic is postmodernism. Postmodernism, which opposes the benefits of modernism, criticized modernism for reducing the human mind to a single dimension and causing it to lose its historicity. Thus, what is abnormal according to modernism has been called difference according to postmodernism (Cirhinlioğlu and Cirhinlioğlu, 2011: 396). Based on this, the proposition that spirituality is a clear example of postmodernism has been put forward. The increase in research on spirituality in the postmodern age appears as a result of secularization. Researchers have found that spirituality is associated with emotional, rational, cognitive and unconscious symbolic areas (Gross, 2006: 425). For modernism, "the other" means tradition, while for postmodernism it is modernism itself.

If we look at the relationship of spirituality with Decency, it would be appropriate to compare religion, religious practices, the differences between religion and spirituality. We know that religiosity is a broad topic that covers thoughts and attitudes related to religion. There are different meanings attached to the concept, and the reasons for this are differences in perspectives and interpretations. We see that people express themselves as religious even if they do not fulfill the practical applications of the religions to which they belong. The issue that we see as important here is that there is an approach such as faith in God and feeling closeness. In other words, even if individuals do not practice their religious practices, they express themselves as religious because of their faith and closeness to God. However, individuals have brought the worship of both futile and expressed as obligatory, although in their minds, because of their delusion, they might have lost their closeness to even God (Horozcu, 2010: 210-211).

Religion and Spirituality in the Process of Social Change

An important phenomenon that has been discussed in many fields during the historical process and theses have been put forward on it is the change that is at the heart of social life. Social scientists who express a process itself and examine the phenomena of change and transformation of societies have stated that the speed of change in social structures in traditional societies is more limited than in modern societies. However, we can say that the phenomenon of change has also taken on a different character as a result of the thought, scientific developments that came with the enlightenment and the processes that deformed the traditional social structure.

We can state that the impact of modernization on religious life and beliefs occurs intermittently. For example, with the mechanization that developed with the Industrial Revolution and the emergence of the working class, it did not just stay in the geographies where it appeared, but brought the whole world under its indirect or direct influence. Thus, especially after the Second World War, the waves of immigration that increased their speed revealed urbanization, as a result of which great changes were observed not only in social relations, but also in religion and worldviews. On the other hand science, technology and developments in the mass media, the rapid growth of bureaucratic structures, such as the emergence of radical changes in the political structure observed modernization and liberal democracy can be considered as an extension of her, which ultimately has led to the process of secularization.

On the other hand, in the transition from traditional society to modern society as the chief Actor in the life of the community, individuals who are changing the world at a dizzying pace by quickly adapting to everyday life and technology furthered by the development have begun to benefit from the blessings of modern life. However, as time has passed, they have witnessed that the ultimate happiness and peace promised by modern life has not been realized. Despite the fact that individual and social freedom has increased significantly compared to previous periods, it has been observed that many people have begun to feel uncomfortable that something is not going well. Therefore, the fatigue of modernism, the coldness of communism - despite its promises at a high level, the boredom of increasing individual freedom and the meaninglessness of monopolistic political discourses show us that an era has come to an end.

Conclusion and Discussion

Although it is said that there is a spiritual structure of religious understandings in the studies carried out, it is worth noting that spirituality is a door that opens from within this spiritual structure. We can say that religion, which is seen as a superstructure institution, is involved in relationships in all areas of life.

We have seen that religion and spirituality were confused in the early periods, but as we come to the present day, this idea has been abandoned. Along with this, we have also established that spirituality does not have a purely spiritual meaning, but is a concept that has a corresponding meaning in practice.

We can state that spirituality is relational by nature, that it has a connection between religion and moral values, that it has an impact on shaping lived experiences, and that it is necessary to use the concepts of prejudice and tolerance to Decipher it.

Scientific methods exist as the thing developed to achieve the truth, as the thing that characterizes the phenomenon of modernization. Before modernization, while truth was based on the ultimate example of transcendental elements outside of human experience, the basic truth was located within the religious field. Modernity saw the human mind or human experience as the basis of truth.

Finally, it can be stated that spirituality is relational by nature, that it has a connection between religion and moral values, that it has an impact on shaping lived experiences, and that it is necessary to employ the concepts of prejudice and tolerance to Decipher it. In addition, the study is based on the problematic of creating a model of how religious and spiritual elements contained in the field of faith can be evaluated in a relational way.

References

Apalı, Y. (2020). "Din Kurumu ve Toplumsal Yapı". D. Ali Arslan (ed). içinde Toplumsal Yapı. Çanakkale: Paradigma Akademi.

Armstrong, T. D. (1995). "Exploring Spirituality: The Development of The Armstrong Measure of Spirituality". InR. L. Jones (Ed.), Handbook of Tests and Measurements for Black Populations (Vol. 2, pp. 105-115). Hampton, VA: Cobb and Henry.

- Chee, K. (2002). "The Heart of Leaders: Spirituality in Educational Administration". Paper Presented at The Linking Research to Educational Practice II Symposium at the University of Calgary.
- Cirhinlioğlu, Z.; Cirhinlioğlu, F. G. (2011). "Postmodern Sağlığın Yükselişi ve Düşüşü". K. Canatan (ed). içinde Beden Sosyolojisi. (s. 395-412). Açılım Kitap: İstanbul.
- Çil, G. (2020). "Toplumsal Kurumlar ve Toplumsal Yapı". D. Ali Arslan (ed). içinde Toplumsal Yapı. Çanakkale: Paradigma Akademi.
- Dağcı, A. (2020). Huzurevi Yaşlılarında Sevgi: Manevi Başa Çıkma Bağlamında Bir Araştırma. Türk Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik Dergisi, (2), 9-28.
- Doyle, D. (1992). "Have We Looked Beyond The Physical and Psychosocial?". Journal of Pain Symptom Management, 7, 5, 302–311.
- Düzgüner, S. (2013a). Maneviyat Algısı ve Diğerkâmlıkla İlişkisi (Kan Bağışı Örneğinde Türkiye ve Amerika Karşılaştırmalı Nitel Bir Araştırma), Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi, Konya.
- Düzgüner, S. (2013b). "Din ve Maneviyat Psikolojisi Temel Yaklaşımlar ve İlgi Alanları". İhsan Çapcıoğlu ve Ali Ayten (ed). Dindarlık ve Maneviyat, Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi.
- Dyson, J., Cobb, M., Forman, D. (1997). "The Meaning of Spirituality: A Literature Review". Journal of Advanced Nursing, 26 (6), 1183-1188. DOI: 10.1046/j.1365-2648.1997.00446.x
- Elkins, D. N., Hedstrom, L. J., Hughes, L. L., Leaf, J. A., Saunders, C. (1988). "Toward a Humanistic-Phenomenological Spirituality: Definition, Description, and Measurement". Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 28(4): 5-18. (Vaughan, 1991: 105):
- Fisher, J. (2011). "The Four Domains Model: Connecting Spirituality, Health and Well-Being". Religions, 2, 17-28; doi:10.3390/rel2010017
- Gross, Z. (2006). "Spirituality, Contemporary Approaches to Defining". E. M. Dowling and W. G. Scarlett (ed). Encyclopedia of Religious and Spiritual Development. (pp. 424-425). Sage Publications: Thousand Oakss, London, and New Delhi.
- Günay, Ü. (1986). Modern Sanayi Toplumlarında Din I. E.Ü.İ.F. Dergisi, 4(3), 41-88.
- Günay, Ü. (1999). Erzurum ve Çevre Köylerinde Dini Hayat. İstanbul: Dergah Yayınları.
- Hamer, D. (2005). God Gene: How Faith is Hardwired into Our Genes. New York: Doubleday
- Hart, T. (1994). Hidden Spring: The Spiritual Dimension of Therapy. Mahwah, N. J., U. S.: Paulist Press.
- Horozcu, Ü. (2010). "Tecrübî Araştırmalar Işığında Dindarlık ve Maneviyat ile Ruhsal ve Bedensel Sağlık Arasındaki İlişki". Milel ve Nihal, 7 (1), 209-240
- Huitt, W., Robbins, J. (2003). An Introduction to Spiritual Development. Paper Presented at the 11th Annual Conference: Applied Psychology in Education, Mental Health, and Business, Valdosta, GA, October 3. Retrieved [date], from http://www.edpsycinteractive.org/papers/spirituality.pdf
- Karaşahin, H. (2006). Gördes ve Çevresinde Dini Hayat, Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi, Ankara.
- Kirk, K. M.; Eaves, L. J.; Martin, N. G.(1999). Self Transcendence as a Measure of Spirituality in a Sample of Older Australian Twins. Twin Research, 2.
- Kurtz, E. (2000). "Historical Context", Integrating Spirituality Into Treatment: Resources for Practitioners, (Ed.: William R. Miller). Integrating Spirituality Into Treatment: Resources for Pragtitioners, Washington: American Psychological Association Press.

- Lepherd L. (2015). "Spirituality: Everyone Has It, But What Is It?". International Journal of Nursing Practice, 21: 566–574
- Newman, D. (2013). Sosyoloji, Günlük Yaşamın Mimarisini Keşfetmek. A. Arslan, (çev). Ankara: Nobel Yayınları.
- Özdoğan, Ö. (2006'a). "İnsanı Anlamaya Yönelik Bir Yaklaşım: Pastoral Psikoloji". Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, 47, (2), 127-141. DOI: 10.1501/Ilhfak_0000000054.
- Özdoğan, Ö. (2009). Aşkın yanımız maneviyat. Ankara: Özdenöze Yayınları.
- Puchalski, C. M., Blatt B., Kogan M., Butler, A. (2014). "Spirituality and Health: The Development of a Field". Academic Medicine, Vol. 89, No. 1. Page:10-16, doi: 10.1097/ACM.0000000000000083.
- Sarıbay, A. Y. (1994). Refah Partisinin Ardındaki Sosyo-politik Dinamikler, Türkiye Günlüğü, 27.
- Schlehofer, M. M., Omoto, A. M., Adelman, J. R. (2008). "How Do "Religion" and "Spirituality" Differ? Lay Definitions Among Older Adults". Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, Vol. 47, No. 3, pp. 411-425
- Shafranske, E. P., Gorsuch, R. L. (1984). "Factors Associated With The Perception of Spirituality In Psychotherapy". Journal of Transpersonal Psychology, 16(2), 231–241. (Benner, 1989: 20);
- Shaw, John A. (2005). A Pathway to Sprituality. Psychiatry(68)4, 350-362.
- Spilka, B. vd., "A General Attribution Theory for the Psychology of Religion", Journal for the Psychology of Religion, 24(1), 1985., ss. 11.
- Streib, H.; Hood Jr, R. W.; Klein, C. (2010). The Religious Schema Scale: Construction and Initial Validation of a Quantitative Measure for Religious Styles. The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion 20(3), 151-172.
- Tart, C. (1975). Introduction. In Tart C. T. (Ed), Transpersonal Psychologies (pp. 3-7). New York: Harper & Row.
- Topses, M. D. (2006). Kurumlar Sosyolojisi. Ankara: Nobel Akademik Yayılcılık.
- Türkyılmaz, N. (2008). Davranış Genetiği Bağlamında Dini ve Manevi Eğilimler, Marmara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi, İstanbul.
- Uluocak, Ş. (2005). Sosyo-bilişsel ve Politik İletişim Süreçleri Açısından Bir Söylem Evreni Olarak Küreselleşme ve Kollektif Bir Aidiyet Biçimi Olarak Ulusal Kimlikler Üzerine Eleştirel Bir Söylem Analizi, Hacettepe Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi, Ankara.
- Wach, J. (1990). Din Sosyolojisi. Ünver Günay(çev.). Erciyes Üniversitesi Yayınları: Kayseri.
- Weaver II, R.; Cotrell, H. (1992). "A Nonreligious Spirituality That Causes Students To Clarity Their Values And To Respond With Passion". Education, 112 (3), 426.
- Zembilci, S. (2017). Alternatif Maneviyat Arayışları: Siber Maneviyat Örneği, Marmara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yayımlanmamış Yüksel Lisans Tezi, İstanbul.